



# DRAFT

## City of Santa Barbara

### Planning Division

#### HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION MINUTES

**Wednesday, October 12, 2011     David Gebhard Public Meeting Room: 630 Garden Street     1:30 P.M.**

**COMMISSION MEMBERS:**

PHILIP SUDING, *Chair* – Present  
DONALD SHARPE, *Vice-Chair* – Present  
LOUISE BOUCHER – Present  
MICHAEL DRURY – Present until 5:05 p.m.  
WILLIAM LA VOIE – Absent  
FERMINA MURRAY – Present  
JUDY ORÍAS – Present  
CRAIG SHALLANBERGER – Absent

**ADVISORY MEMBER:**

DR. MICHAEL GLASSOW – Absent

**CITY COUNCIL LIAISON:**

MICHAEL SELF – Absent

**PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON:**

STELLA LARSON – Absent

**STAFF:**

JAIME LIMÓN, Design Review Supervisor – Present until 2:40 p.m. and again at 3:15 p.m.  
MICHAEL BERMAN, Project Planner/Environmental Analyst – Present at 2:40 p.m. until 5:00 p.m.  
SUSAN GANTZ, Planning Technician – Absent  
GABRIELA FELICIANO, Commission Secretary – Present

**Website: [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov)**

**NOTICE:**

- A. On Friday, October 7, 2011, at 4:00 P.M., this Agenda was duly posted on the indoor and outdoor bulletin boards at the Community Development Department, 630 Garden Street, and online at [www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc](http://www.SantaBarbaraCa.gov/hlc).
- B. This regular meeting of the Historic Landmarks Commission was broadcast live on TV Channel 18 and rebroadcast in its entirety on Friday at 1:00 p.m. A live broadcast could also be seen via personal computer by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/Government/Video) and then clicking *City TV-18 Live Broadcast*. An archived video copy of this meeting is viewable on computers with high speed internet access by going to [www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc](http://www.santabarbaraca.gov/hlc) and then clicking *Online Meetings*.

**CALL TO ORDER.**

The Full Board meeting was called to order at 1:31 p.m. by Chair Suding.

**ATTENDANCE:**

**Members present:** Sharpe, Boucher, Drury, Murray, Orías, and Suding.

**Members absent:** La Voie and Shallanberger.

**Staff present:** Limón, Berman and Feliciano.

**GENERAL BUSINESS:**

- A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

- B. Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 28, 2011.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of September 28, 2011, with corrections.

**Action:** Boucher/Drury, 4/0/2. (Murray/Sharpe abstained. La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- C. Consent Calendar.

**Motion:** Ratify the Consent Calendar as reviewed by Donald Sharpe.

**Action:** Boucher/Murray, 6/0/0. (Suding stepped down from Item B. La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

- D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals.

1. Mr. Limón made the following announcements:

a) Commissioners La Voie and Shallanberger would be absent from the meeting.

b) Item 1, the project at 1936 State Street, has been postponed two weeks at the applicant's request; and Item 7 (the discussion item) would be moved up to that time slot at 1:45 p.m.

**Motion:** To postpone Item 1 two weeks to the meeting of October 26, 2011.

**Action:** Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

c) HLC members are notified of story poles that have been placed at a project site as a courtesy so that they are aware that a review by the Planning Commission has been scheduled and gives them the opportunity to attend the meeting.

d) The Public Works Department will be providing possible solutions to the brick popping up on the Cabrillo Blvd. crosswalks and the subject will be discussed at a future HLC meeting.

e) The Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History project is being modified in response to various comments. The Commission will discuss constraints and project alternatives with the applicant at the November 9 HLC meeting.

f) Kathy Allen, Planning Technician, was introduced as a new member of the Design Review Team.

2. Ms. Weiss reported on the Lower Mission Creek Flood Control Project. In particular, the bridge adjacent to the property at 15 W. Mason Street that has received a Coastal Development Permit from the Planning Commission and Coastal Commission for its replacement. Comments from the Creeks Advisory Committee and the Transportation Circulation Committee will be forwarded to the Commission since the HLC will be the key discretionary body for this project.

3. Commissioner Drury announced that the application deadline for the Advisory Group annual recruitment is Monday, October 17, at 5:30 p.m. Mr. Limón added that landscape architects are urgently needed to sit on the Design Review boards.

- E. Subcommittee Reports.

Commissioners Murray and Orías reported on the Historic Resources Element Task Force.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****1. 1936 STATE ST**

C-2 Zone

Assessor's Parcel Number: 025-372-001  
Application Number: MST2011-00167  
Owner: Mobil Oil Corporation  
Applicant: Cadence Development  
Agent: Lucy Dinneen  
Architect: Kirk Gradin

(Proposal to construct a new 3,300 square foot, 33 foot tall, one-story, non-residential building on a 22,466 square foot lot. A new parking lot behind the building will provide 18 parking spaces, one space more than required. Grading outside of the building footprint will be balanced on site at 120 cubic yards. Development Plan Approval findings are required by the Historic Landmarks Commission to allow the development of 2,449 square feet of new non-residential floor area. The site has retained an 851 square foot demolition credit.)

**(Second Concept Review. Project requires Environmental Assessment and Development Plan Approval findings. Project was last reviewed on September 14, 2011.)**

**This item was postponed two weeks at the applicant's request; Item 7 was discussed in its place.**

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****2. 424 STATE ST**

C-M Zone

**(2:05)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-212-025  
Application Number: MST2011-00342  
Owner: Ray Mahboob  
Applicant: ATC Design Group  
Architect: Henry Lenny Design Studio  
Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture  
Business Name: 99 Cent Store

(Proposal to enclose a 733 square foot patio/arcade on an existing 11,500 square foot, two-story commercial building and alterations including the following: a new facade on the State Street elevation, infill of several overhead roll-up doors and new entry on the north elevation, new parking lot striping and landscaping, and a new trash enclosure. Also proposed is to repave the existing paseo between State Street and the existing, 25-space parking lot in the rear with brick. Total development on site will total 12,233 square feet.)

**(Second Concept Review. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on September 14, 2011.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio  
Ryan Mills, Architect, DMA

Public comment opened at 2:33 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on sufficient parking and shopping carts placement.

Public comment closed at 2:36 p.m.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. Resolve the storm water control in conformity with El Pueblo Viejo Guidelines.
2. Signage shall conform to the Sign Ordinance.
3. Resolve the parking lot materials to be either asphalt and colored concrete or asphalt and grey concrete.
4. Resolve the scissor lift in the parking lot.
5. Provide larger canopy trees in the parking lot.
6. The Barcelona fixture shall be large enough for the space and appropriately positioned.
7. Select appropriate bioswale vegetation.
8. Provide a cut-sheet for the terracotta pots.
9. No shopping carts shall be stored on State Street.
10. Any additional HVAC equipment shall be screened from any public view.

Action: Boucher/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****3. 651 PASEO NUEVO**

C-2 Zone

**(2:44)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-400-002

Application Number: MST2010-00338

Owner: Santa Barbara Redevelopment Agency

Designer: Henry Lenny Design Studio

Architect: DeVicente Mills Architecture

(This is a revised project description: Proposed enhancement to Paseo Nuevo: Phase 1 of the project includes a concept review of benches, tables, chairs, pottery, umbrellas, new ribbon flag pole element, and modifications to existing lighting plan. Phase 2 of the project is the redesign of the center court and north court. This phase includes benches and new fountain feature in center court, demolition of two arches and circular colonnade, new paving and site wall in north court.)

**(First review of Phase II improvements. Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Phase I received final approval on August 31, 2011.)**

Present: Henry Lenny, Architect, Henry Lenny Design Studio  
Ryan Mils, Architect, DMA  
Trey Lindle, Macerich Management Company-Paseo Nuevo

Public comment opened at 2:56 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. In concept the proposal is acceptable.
2. The majority of the Commission felt that the column fountain needs to be restudied.
3. Provide inspiration examples for the concrete benches.
4. Restudy the removal of the archways between the spaces; what is proposed may not be supportable.

Action: Drury/Sharpe, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**\*\* THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 3:11 P.M. TO 3:15 P.M. \*\***

**CONCEPT REVIEW - CONTINUED****4. 33 W VICTORIA ST**

C-2 Zone

**(3:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-181-001  
Application Number: MST2010-00327  
Owner: Unity Shoppe, Inc.  
Architect: PMSM Architects  
Landscape Architect: Arcadia Studio  
Business Name: Victoria Hall Theater

(This is a **Structure of Merit: "Former First Baptist Church."** The building is eligible for listing as a City of Santa Barbara Landmark, inclusion in the California Register of Historical Resources, and the National Register of Historic Places. Proposed renovation and seismic upgrade including a rerouted circulation pattern at the front entry, reconstruction of the stage house at the south elevation, and raising the existing roof height to 55 feet to accommodate a new fly loft. Changes will occur on the north, east, and south elevations. Project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit.)

**(Fifth Concept Review. Comments only; project requires City Council approval of a Public Works major encroachment permit for improvements within the Victoria Street Right-of-Way. Requires Historic Resource Findings. Project was last reviewed on August 31, 2011.)**

Present: Derek Westen and Steve Metsch, Board Members, Ensemble Theater Company  
Jason Currie, Project Manager, PMSM

Chair Suding disclosed that he and Commissioner Drury reviewed a set of plans electronically and gave feedback to the applicant as they are part of the Victoria Hall Theater *Ad hoc* Subcommittee.

Public comment opened at 3:29 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on the sidewalk height and drop-off area.

John Robattom, adjacent property representative, spoke in support of the design and commented on timing of parking spaces.

Public comment closed at 3:32 p.m.

Straw votes: How many Commissioners would consider the traffic signal located in the location as proposed as acceptable? 2/4 (Boucher/Drury/Sharpe/Suding opposed).

How many Commissioners would request further study for enlarging the drop off area to three cars? 1/5 (Boucher/Drury/Murray/Sharpe/Suding opposed).

**Motion: Project Design Approval and continued indefinitely to the City Council with the following comments and findings:**

1. Study the restrictions of allowable parking times at the drop-off area when theater is not in use.
2. Continue restudying the removal of the power pole at the corner.
3. Resolve the longitudinal slope of the sidewalk with the placement of the benches.
4. Resolve the location of the traffic signal on the corner of Chapala and Victoria Streets. The majority of the Commission supports relocating it.

5. Study the possibility of an addition of a mid-block pedestrian crossing at the entry to the parking lot.
6. **Historic Resource Findings were made as follows:** The project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of an historical resource.

Action: Boucher/Orías, 6/0/0. (La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

### **CONCEPT REVIEW (CONTINUED)**

#### **5. 20 E CARRILLO ST**

C-2 Zone

**(4:04)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-322-047  
Application Number: SGN2011-00091  
Owner: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust  
Applicant: Jeff Reich  
Designer: Chandler Signs  
Contractor: Mall Signs & Service  
Business Name: Santa Barbara Bank & Trust

(This is a revised project description: Concept review of a proposal to replace 138.12 square feet of existing signage with 136.92 square feet of new signage. An existing 15.25 square foot monument sign and an 8 square foot ATM sign are proposed to remain unaltered. The total amount of signage on site will be 160.17 square feet. Exceptions are requested to exceed the 90 square foot maximum total signage allowed and letter height. The linear building frontage is 150 feet.)

**(Third Concept Review. Requires Sign Exception Findings. Project last reviewed on September 28, 2011.)**

Present: John Shehorn, Santa Barbara Bank & Trust  
Joe Mueller, Chandler Signs

Public comment opened at 4:15 p.m. and, as no one wished to speak, it was closed.

**Motion: Final Approval as submitted with the following conditions and findings:**

1. The south-facing sign across from the parking lot shall be reduced by 30%.
2. The color as presented in the cut-out letter "S" is acceptable: PMS201 Red.
3. **Sign Exception Findings were made with respect to exceeding the maximum signage allowed:**
  - a. There are exceptional or extraordinary circumstances or conditions applicable to the property involved, or to the intended use of the property, that do not apply generally to other properties in the vicinity: The site has unusual characteristics in that there are multiple buildings and entrances and the signage has been reduced from the existing.
  - b. The granting of the exception will not be materially detrimental to the public welfare or injurious to the properties or improvements in the vicinity.
  - c. The proposed sign is in conformance with the stated purpose and intent of the Sign Ordinance.

Action: Sharpe/Drury, 4/0/2. (Murray/Orías abstained. La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING****6. 902 CHAPALA ST A**

C-2 Zone

**(4:46)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-321-019

Application Number: MST2011-00347

Owner: Cynthia Howard Gift Trust

Agent: Suzanne Elledge Planning and Permitting Services

Architect: Kupiec Architects

(Proposal to demolish an existing 8,818 square foot two-story building and construct a 52'-6" tall, four-story, mixed-use building including 10,836 square feet of commercial floor area and 8,833 square feet of residential floor area. There will be four 2-bedroom units and four 1-bedroom units for a total of eight residential units. The project includes 22 covered ground level parking spaces, and is located in the 100% parking zone of benefit. Total development on site will be 28,755 square feet on a 16,868 square foot parcel. Historic Landmarks Commission approval of a Development Plan is requested to allow the construction of 2,018 square feet of new Measure E floor area.)

**(Comments only; project requires Environmental Assessment, Development Plan Approval findings, and Project Compatibility Analysis.)**

Present: Robert Kupiec and Jaime Palencia, Kupiec Architects  
Trish Allen, SEPPS

Public comment opened at 4:59 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, commented on building height reduction.

Public comment closed at 5:00 p.m.

**Motion: Continued four weeks with the following comments:**

1. This project is headed in the right direction.
2. The Commission is appreciative of the Spanish character and charm.
3. The height is problematic and should be reduced.
4. Articulation and modulation needs to happen more on the second and third floors; and should give a sense of purpose of the open space on the southeast corner of the property (across from Paseo Nuevo on Canon Perdido Street). The Commission expressed appreciation for the use of this as relief and open space.
5. Open space within the project on the second and third floors should be utilized for the articulation, modulation and setbacks of those floors.
6. The second floor open space needs to be articulated and designed with meaningful landscape.

Action: Sharpe/Boucher, 5/0/0. (Drury/La Voie/Shallanberger absent.) Motion carried.

**DISCUSSION ITEM****7. TRUNCATED DOMES****(1:48)**

Requestor: Phil Suding, Chair  
(Discussion on alternatives to typical terra cotta colored truncated domes.)

This item was reviewed out of order.

Present: Brian D'Amour, Supervising Engineer, Public Works-Engineering

Public comment opened at 1:53 p.m.

Kellam de Forest, local resident, confirmed that there are other manufacturers of the product with the same quality. He suggested that a manufacturer be used that can provide custom colors, such as a decomposed granite color.

Public comment closed at 1:56 p.m.

**Discussion held.**

**CONSENT CALENDAR (11:00)****REVIEW AFTER FINAL****A. 1816 STATE ST****C-2/R-1 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 027-032-021  
Application Number: MST2009-00281  
Owner: Alamar II, LLC  
Architect: Bryan Murphy  
Business Name: Fiesta Inn & Suites

(Proposal for an addition and exterior alterations to an existing three story commercial building. The proposal includes facade alterations, a 62 square foot lobby addition, a tower addition having no new floor area, a 270 square foot storage room addition on the 3rd floor of the building, a new 312 square foot deck, two new patio areas totaling 585 square feet, widening the second floor corridor by 164 square feet, and alterations to the existing parking lot. This project received Planning Commission approval. Approval of this project will abate violations outlined in ENF2008-01335.)

**(Review After Final of proposed changes to roof detail, new stair to tower and second floor landing, new stairs at parking lot, and relocation of lobby entry doors and window. Requires compliance with Planning Commission Resolution No. 018-10.)**

**Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. To rectify column locations on elevations as proposed is not acceptable. Resolve this with posts stacked directly above the columns below.
2. All other proposed changes are acceptable.



**REVIEW AFTER FINAL****B. 330 STATE ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-254-014  
Application Number: MST2011-00031  
Owner: Hicks & Topakas Family Trust  
Architect: Jeff Shelton  
Landscape Architect: Suding Design Landscape Architects  
Business Name: Casa Blanca Restaurant and Cantina

(This is a **Structure of Merit: "Former Seaside Oil Co. Building and Showroom, aka Andalucia Building."** Proposal for exterior alterations to a commercial building including new outdoor dining patio, patio walls, entry doors on east elevation, building finishes, light fixtures, fencing, landscaping, backflow device, and trash enclosure relocation. New roof-top mechanical equipment will be completely screened by an existing parapet. No new floor area is proposed. The parking requirement for this parcel in the 80% Parking Zone of Benefit is five spaces, with the parking lot to be restriped to maintain the 17 previously-approved parking spaces. No other parking lot work is being proposed.)

**(Review After Final to 1) eliminate the built-in bench that was inside the patio, 2) change approved patio furniture from wood to wrought iron, 3) relocate backflow device from building to patio, 4) install 3 bike parking spaces, and 5) omit iron fence from side of building.)**

**Final Approval of Review After Final with the condition that another plant shall be added at the center of the backflow device for additional screening.**

**NEW ITEM****C. 802 STATE ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-052-010  
Application Number: MST2011-00387  
Owner: WFG 800 State Street, LLC  
Applicant: Benton Signs  
Business name: Goorin Bros. Hat Shop

(Proposal to recover the existing and approved awning frame with new fabric to go with new approved signage. Proposed fabric color is Sunbrella #4708 black. No change is proposed for the awning framing or location.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted.**

**NEW ITEM****D. 701 CHAPALA ST****C-2 Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-082-008  
Application Number: MST2011-00385  
Owner: Nancy Brock Trust  
Designer: Thomas Morrison

(Proposal to install new redwood decking inside an existing fenced patio. New umbrellas, tables, and chairs are also proposed for outdoor seating at the existing restaurant.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Continued two weeks with the following comments:**

1. Study a different chair solution.
2. Side ramp access only is acceptable to the Building and Safety Division.
3. Verify ADA acceptability for step onto new deck.
4. Umbrellas and tables are acceptable.

**NEW ITEM****E. 428 CHAPALA ST****C-M Zone**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 037-211-026  
Application Number: MST2011-00386  
Owner: Casa De Sevilla Partners, LP  
Applicant: Diana Arrieta

(Proposal for a new greenhouse located at the rear of the existing restaurant and a new outdoor seating area consisting of 4 patio tables and 16 chairs along south side of property.)

**(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided.)**

**Project Design and Final Approvals as submitted with the following conditions:**

1. The color of the greenhouse shall match the building.
2. Staff is to follow up on the trash containers located by the street.

**\*\* MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:26 P.M. \*\***